towards a more sustainable Buffalo Niagara

Fair Housing Equity Assessment Advisory Committee Meeting 2: The Regional Picture

Anthony Armstrong, Facilitator
FHEA Meeting 2: The Regional Picture

UBRI has prepared and will present:
A draft outline and structure of the FHEA
A synopsis of regional data collected and analyzed to date

Advisory Committee:
Will be asked to review and comment on the draft outline and presentation with a focus on refining the shared definition of equity, barriers to equity and opportunity and identifying missing or qualifying data and data sources.
Agenda Meeting 2: The Regional Picture

Welcome & Introductions
Draft Narrative Outline
Regional Data Presentation
Review a Shared Definition of Equity
Next steps
An Introduction to:
The Fair Housing Equity Assessment

The Fair Housing Equity Assessment (FHEA) is a comprehensive examination of the current state of racial and ethnic inequality within the region. This examination takes into account current barriers to opportunity as well as historical causes of segregation and exclusion.

Though not required, most other HUD regional planning grantees have taken the opportunity to do some level of analysis for additional protected classes.
An Introduction to:
The Fair Housing Equity Assessment

1. **Understand** the historical, current and future context for equity and opportunity in the region and the data and evidence that demonstrates those dynamics

2. **Engage** regional leaders and stakeholders on findings and implications of analysis

3. **Integrate** knowledge developed through the Regional FHEA exercise into the strategy development process (e.g., priority setting and decision making)
An Introduction to: The Fair Housing Equity Assessment

3D’s of the FHEA

1. **Data Analysis** (breath and depth, within and across, trends)

2. **Deliberation/Engagement** (have to engage region on findings, engage in tough conversations and tradeoffs; can’t “sit on shelf”)

3. **Decision-Making** (use as frame in priority setting; “The Bridge”)
BUFFALO-NIAGARA’S FAIR HOUSING EQUITY ASSESSMENT

HUD REQUIRED FHEA ESSENTIAL ELEMENTS:

1) Segregated Areas and Areas of Increasing Diversity and/or Racial/Ethnic Integration

2) Racially/Ethnically Concentrated Areas of Poverty

3) Access to Existing Areas of High Opportunity

4) Major Public Investments

5) Fair Housing Issues, Services, and Activities.
Buffalo-Niagara’s Fair Housing Equity Assessment

HUD Supplied Format:

1. Background
2. Segregation
3. Racially Concentrated Areas of Poverty
4. Disparities in Access to Opportunity
5. Fair Housing Infrastructure
6. Physical Infrastructure
7. Strategies & Action Plan
Buffalo-Niagara’s Fair Housing Equity Assessment

Suggested Format:

1. Executive Summary
2. Background & Introduction
3. Segregation
4. Racially /Ethnically Concentrated Areas of Poverty
5. Disparities in Access to Opportunity
6. Physical Infrastructure & Public Investment
7. Fair Housing Infrastructure
8. Summary, Recommendations, Next Steps & 1RF integration
Buffalo-Niagara’s Fair Housing Equity Assessment

1. **Executive Summary**

2. **Background & Introduction**
   a. What is the FHEA?

3. **Segregation**
   a. Segregation & Discrimination in the Region
   b. Factors Contributing to Segregation in the Region
   c. Segregated Areas and Areas of Increasing Diversity and/or Racial/Ethnic Integration
Buffalo-Niagara’s Fair Housing Equity Assessment

4. Racially /Ethnically Concentrated Areas of Poverty
   a. Poverty Trends throughout the Region
   b. Identification of racially concentrated areas of poverty
   c. Factors contributing to development of individual R/ECAPs
   d. Analysis and strategy delineation

5. Disparities in Access to Opportunity
   a. Where are the areas of high opportunity?
   b. What proportion of the region’s residents live in such areas?
   c. Are there disparities of neighborhood opportunity for racial/ethnic minorities? Are they significant?
   d. Are certain elements of opportunity more inequitably located across groups?
   e. How do these inequities (or lack of) align with your public investments?
   f. Analysis and strategy delineation
Buffalo-Niagara’s Fair Housing Equity Assessment

6. Physical Infrastructure and Public Investment
   a. Major Public Investments
   b. Drivers of inequitable investment
   c. Strategies and activities to overcome

7. Fair Housing Infrastructure
   a. Fair Housing Activities
   b. Fair Housing Services
   c. Fair Housing Issues

8. Summary, Recommendations, Next Steps & 1RF integration
The Regional Picture

A look at the data collected and analyzed for the FHEA to date...

1) Segregated Areas and Areas of Increasing Diversity and/or Racial/Ethnic Integration

2) Racially/Ethnically Concentrated Areas of Poverty

3) Access to Existing Areas of High Opportunity
The Regional Picture

1) Segregated Areas and Areas of Increasing Diversity and/or Racial/Ethnic Integration

   a) Regional Population Shifts
   b) Racial and Ethnic Patterns
   c) Segregated Areas
   d) Racial/ Ethnic and Demographic Change
The Regional Picture

1) Segregated Areas and Areas of Increasing Diversity and/or Racial/Ethnic Integration

a) Regional Population Shifts

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>BN-municipalities</th>
<th>% Change, 1990-2010</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-0.203622 - 0.000000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.000001 - 0.100000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.100001 - 0.250000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.250001 - 0.500000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>over 50 % increase</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
1) Segregated Areas and Areas of Increasing Diversity and/or Racial/Ethnic Integration

a) Regional Population Shifts

From 1990 - 2010 Centers of population decline continue to be inner cities and first ring suburbs:

- City of Buffalo: 20.4% loss
- Niagara Falls: 18.8% loss
- North Tonawanda: 15.20% loss
- Tonawanda City: 12.5% loss
- Lackawanna: 11.9% loss
The Regional Picture

1) Segregated Areas and Areas of Increasing Diversity and/or Racial/Ethnic Integration

b) Racial and Ethnic Patterns
The Regional Picture

1) Segregated Areas and Areas of Increasing Diversity and/or Racial/Ethnic Integration

b) Racial and Ethnic Patterns
The Regional Picture

1) Segregated Areas and Areas of Increasing Diversity and/or Racial/Ethnic Integration

b) Racial and Ethnic Patterns
1) Segregated Areas and Areas of Increasing Diversity and/or Racial/Ethnic Integration

b) Racial and Ethnic Patterns

Distribution of Non-Hispanic White Population
The Regional Picture

1) Segregated Areas and Areas of Increasing Diversity and/or Racial/Ethnic Integration

b) Racial and Ethnic Patterns

Distribution of Black Population
1) Segregated Areas and Areas of Increasing Diversity and/or Racial/Ethnic Integration

b) Racial and Ethnic Patterns

Distribution of Hispanic Population
The Regional Picture

1) Segregated Areas and Areas of Increasing Diversity and/or Racial/Ethnic Integration

b) Racial and Ethnic Patterns

Distribution of Asian Population
The Regional Picture

1) Segregated Areas and Areas of Increasing Diversity and/or Racial/Ethnic Integration

c) Segregated Areas

Disparity of Predicted/Actual Racial Composition Based on Economic Distribution

White
1) Segregated Areas and Areas of Increasing Diversity and/or Racial/Ethnic Integration

c) Segregated Areas

Disparity of Predicted/Actual Racial Composition Based on Economic Distribution

African American/Black
The Regional Picture

1) Segregated Areas and Areas of Increasing Diversity and/or Racial/Ethnic Integration

c) Segregated Areas

Disparity of Predicted/Actual Racial Composition Based on Economic Distribution

Hispanic/ Latino
The Regional Picture

1) Segregated Areas and Areas of Increasing Diversity and/or Racial/Ethnic Integration

c) Segregated Areas

Disparity of Predicted/Actual Racial Composition Based on Economic Distribution

Asian
The Regional Picture

1) Segregated Areas and Areas of Increasing Diversity and/or Racial/Ethnic Integration

c) Segregated Areas

Disparity of Predicted/Actual Racial Composition Based on Economic Distribution

Native
The Regional Picture

1) Segregated Areas and Areas of Increasing Diversity and/or Racial/Ethnic Integration

c) Segregated Areas

Disparity of Predicted/Actual Racial Composition Based on Economic Distribution

Other Race
The Regional Picture

1) Segregated Areas and Areas of Increasing Diversity and/or Racial/Ethnic Integration

   c) Segregated Areas

Disparity of Predicted/Actual Racial Composition Based on Economic Distribution

Two or More Races
The Regional Picture

1) Segregated Areas and Areas of Increasing Diversity and/or Racial/Ethnic Integration

c) Segregated Areas

Dissimilarity Index
The Regional Picture

1) Segregated Areas and Areas of Increasing Diversity and/or Racial/Ethnic Integration

d) Racial/ Ethnic and Demographic Change
The Regional Picture

1) Segregated Areas and Areas of Increasing Diversity and/or Racial/Ethnic Integration

d) Racial/ Ethnic and Demographic Change

% Change of Overall Population Composition 1990-2010
All Non-White Races
1) Segregated Areas and Areas of Increasing Diversity and/or Racial/Ethnic Integration

d) Racial/ Ethnic and Demographic Change

% Change of Overall Population Composition 1990-2010
All Non-White Races and Hispanic/ Latino
The Regional Picture

1) Segregated Areas and Areas of Increasing Diversity and/or Racial/Ethnic Integration

d) Racial/ Ethnic and Demographic Change

% Change of Overall Population Composition 1990-2010

African American/ Black

Percent Change in Race 1990 to 2010

- Black
  - 5% - 8%
  - 3% - 4%
  - 2%
  - 0% - 1%
  - -1%
The Regional Picture

1) Segregated Areas and Areas of Increasing Diversity and/or Racial/Ethnic Integration

d) Racial/ Ethnic and Demographic Change

% Change of Overall Population Composition 1990-2010
Hispanic/ Latino
The Regional Picture

1) Segregated Areas and Areas of Increasing Diversity and/or Racial/Ethnic Integration

d) Racial/ Ethnic and Demographic Change

% Change of Overall Population Composition 1990-2010
Asian
The Regional Picture

1) Segregated Areas and Areas of Increasing Diversity and/or Racial/Ethnic Integration

   d) Racial/ Ethnic and Demographic Change

% Change of Overall Population Composition 1990-2010
Some Other Race

Percent Change in Race 1990 to 2010
Other

3% - 7%
2%
2% - 1%
-5% - 1%
-8% - -6%
The Regional Picture

1) Segregated Areas and Areas of Increasing Diversity and/or Racial/Ethnic Integration

d) Racial/Ethnic and Demographic Change

% Change of Overall Population Composition 1990-2010
White Non-Hispanic

Percent Change in Race 1990 to 2010
White Non Hispanic

-20% - -10%
-9% - -6%
-5% - -3%
-2% - -1%
0% - 2%
The Regional Picture

2) Racially/Ethnically Concentrated Areas of Poverty

a) Poverty Index
b) Concentrated Poverty - 40% of more of families living in poverty
c) Poverty Trends
d) Intersection with Racial/ Ethnic Concentration (RCAPs/ECAPs)
The Regional Picture

2) Racially/Ethnically Concentrated Areas of 
   Poverty

a) Poverty Index
The Regional Picture

2) Racially/Ethnically Concentrated Areas of Poverty
   b) 40% of more of families living in poverty

Niagara County
   tracts 206, 209 (Niagara Falls)
2) Racially/Ethnically Concentrated Areas of Poverty

b) 40% of more of families living in poverty

Erie County tracts 14.02, 16, 31, 44.02, 55, 61, 69, 70, 71.01, 71.02, 164, 171 (Buffalo), 83 (Tonawanda), 9401 (Tonawanda Reservation)
2) Racially/Ethnically Concentrated Areas of Poverty

b) 40% of more of families living in poverty

City of Buffalo
tracts 14.02, 16, 31, 44.02, 55, 61, 69, 70, 71.01, 71.02, 164, 171
The Regional Picture

2) Racially/Ethnically Concentrated Areas of Poverty

c) Poverty Trends

Erie County
2) Racially/Ethnically Concentrated Areas of Poverty

c) Poverty Trends

City of Buffalo
The Regional Picture

2) Racially/Ethnically Concentrated Areas of Poverty

c) Poverty Trends

Niagara County
The Regional Picture

2) Racially/Ethnically Concentrated Areas of Poverty

c) Poverty Trends

Niagara Falls
2) Racially/Ethnically Concentrated Areas of Poverty

d) Concentrated Poverty by race/ethnicity

City of Buffalo
The Regional Picture

3) Access to Existing Areas of High Opportunity

HUD required indicators of Opportunity:

a) Education
b) Poverty
c) Job Access
d) Labor Market Engagement
e) Housing / Neighborhood Stability
3) Access to Existing Areas of High Opportunity

a) Education

School Proficiency:
local school math & reading scores / state average
3) Access to Existing Areas of High Opportunity

a) Education
   School Proficiency:
   local school math & reading scores / state average
3) Access to Existing Areas of High Opportunity

b) Poverty

Poverty Index:
- Family Poverty Rate
- % households receiving public assistance
The Regional Picture

3) Access to Existing Areas of High Opportunity

b) Poverty

Poverty Index:
- Family Poverty Rate
- % households receiving public assistance
3) Access to Existing Areas of High Opportunity

  c) Job Access
    Job Access Index:
    - Tract-level Job Counts
    - Tract-level worker counts
    - Origin-destination flows
    - Aggregate commute time
    - Tract-tract average commute time by mode
The Regional Picture

3) Access to Existing Areas of High Opportunity

c) Job Access

Job Access Index:

- Tract-level Job Counts
- Tract-level worker counts
- Origin-destination flows
- Aggregate commute time
- Tract-tract average commute time by mode
The Regional Picture

3) Access to Existing Areas of High Opportunity

d) Labor Market Engagement

Labor Market Engagement Index:
- Unemployment Rate
- Labor Force Participation Rate
- % with Bachelors or higher

Legend

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Labor Market</th>
<th>Low</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
<th>9</th>
<th>High</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
The Regional Picture

3) Access to Existing Areas of High Opportunity

d) Labor Market Engagement

Labor Market Engagement Index:
- Unemployment Rate
- Labor Force Participation Rate
- % with Bachelors or higher
3) Access to Existing Areas of High Opportunity

e) Housing / Neighborhood Stability
   Housing / Neighborhood Stability Index:
   - Homeownership Rate
   - % Loans Low-Cost (Refinance)
   - % Loans Low-Cost (New Purchase)
   - % Vacant (Non-Seasonal)
   - % Overcrowded
3) Access to Existing Areas of High Opportunity

e) Housing / Neighborhood Stability

Home Mortgage Disclosure Act (HMDA)
loan originations 2010-2011
3) Access to Existing Areas of High Opportunity

e) housing stability

Home Mortgage Disclosure Act (HMDA) loan denials 2010-2011
The Regional Picture

3) Access to Existing Areas of High Opportunity

e) housing stability

Home Mortgage Disclosure Act (HMDA) loan originations 2010-2011
The Regional Picture

3) Access to Existing Areas of High Opportunity

e) housing stability

Home Mortgage Disclosure Act (HMDA) loan denials 2010-2011
The Regional Picture

3) Access to Existing Areas of High Opportunity

Other Potential Indicators:

f) Transit Access
g) Health Hazards
h) Food Access
i) Neighborhood Health Access (need)
j) Recreation Access (need)
k) Municipal Fiscal Capacity (need)
3) Access to Existing Areas of High Opportunity

f) Transit Access

Transit Index:
HUD supplied data evaluating local transit data in relation to jobs and services near each route and stop.
The Regional Picture

3) Access to Existing Areas of High Opportunity

f) Transit Access

Transit Index:
HUD supplied data evaluating local transit data in relation to jobs and services near each route and stop.
3) Access to Existing Areas of High Opportunity
   
g) Health Hazards
   Health Hazards Index:
   HUD supplied data measuring exposure to harmful toxins
The Regional Picture

3) Access to Existing Areas of High Opportunity

  g) Health Hazards

  Health Hazards Index:
  HUD supplied data measuring exposure to harmful toxins
The Regional Picture

3) Access to Existing Areas of High Opportunity

h) Food Access

Vehicle Ownership & Supermarket Access

5 minute walking access to supermarkets

% households at risk
- 40% - 100%
- 24% - 39%
- 11% - 23%
- 0% - 10%
3) Access to Existing Areas of High Opportunity

h) Food Access

Vehicle Ownership & Supermarket Access
The Regional Picture

Still needed:

4) Major Public Investments
   a) Economic Development
      REDC investments
      IDA projects
   b) Transportation projects
      Highway Transit & Freight
   c) Housing and Community Development
      affordable housing, capacity and social service, CDBG, food access

5) Fair Housing
   a) reported cases
   b) agencies and infrastructure
A Shared Definition of Equity

Discussion Draft for One Region Forward

Buffalo Niagara will be an equitable community when:

all people -- regardless of how they look, who they know and who they love, what language they speak, when or where they were born, where they live, where they go to school or why they call this place home -- have the ability, opportunity and the tools needed to fulfill their potential, lead healthy and fulfilling lives with rewarding work and experience all our region has to offer while ensuring future generations may do the same.
A Shared Definition of Equity

Working Draft for One Region Forward

Buffalo Niagara will be an equitable community when:

all people – regardless of how they look, who they know or who they love, what language they speak, what they believe, whatever their level of means or ability, when or where they were born, where they live, where they go to school or why or how long they’ve called this place home – have the opportunity, resources and tools needed to achieve their potential, to lead healthy and fulfilling lives with rewarding work, and to access, experience, and participate in all our region has to offer while ensuring others – now and in future generations – can do the same.
Next Steps

Preparation for January Meeting: Telling Our Story

UBRI will prepare and present:
- Compiled public comments from Community Congress/web poll
- A draft narrative of the FHEA

Advisory Committee:
- Will be asked to review and comment on the narrative and advise on strategy for soliciting public comments.
Join us at one of five Community Congress Workshops to be held across the region.

Tuesday, November 12th
Amherst Central High School,
4301 Main Street, Amherst, NY

Wednesday, November 13th
City Honors School
186 E North Street, Buffalo, NY

Thursday, November 14th
Parkdale Elementary School, 141 Girard Avenue, East Aurora, NY

Friday, November 15th
Starpoint Central High School,
4363 Mapleton Road, Pendleton, NY

Saturday, November 16th
Niagara Power Project Visitors Center
The “Power Vista”
5777 Lewiston Road, Lewiston, NY
Fair Housing Equity Assessment Advisory Committee

If you have any questions, please feel free to contact us

Teresa Bosch de Celis
One Region Forward Project Assistant
tboschde@buffalo.edu

Anthony Armstrong
1RF Housing & Neighborhoods and FHEA Coordinator
anthony@makecommunities.com