



In Attendance: Anthony Armstrong (UBRI), Glenn B. Nellis (Erie County Association of Governments / Town of Eden), Mike Riegel (Belmont Housing Resources for WNY), James Bragg (CNF), Darren Kemper (NFTA), Bradshaw Hovey (UBRI), Brenda Stynes (UBRI), Laura Smith (BNP), Ben Bidell (Niagara County), Kelly Dixon (GBNRTC), Hal Morse (GBNRTC), Tom Dearing (ECDEP), Bill Parke (OSP), Paul Beyer (NYS DOS), Bart Roberts (UBRI), Bob Shibley (UB)

---

## 1. Events and planning Activities Update

### a. Fair Housing Equity Assessment (FHEA)

- i. The public draft is ready to go.
- ii. Next steps: There is a 30 day public comment period, approval from HUD
- iii. Blended Opportunity Index (7 index)
  1. Poverty index, scope proficiency, labor market index, job access index, housing stability index, environmental health index, food access index
  2. What it tells us: Many challenges in first ring suburbs and northern Niagara county.
  3. Blended opportunity index is then divided by racial opportunity
    - a. Disparities between race and geological location
    - b. Highest opportunities are slanted towards white population in the area.
- iv. The middle of next week there should be a single draft document which to view.
- v. Discussion/Questions

1. Confirmation that this is a study describing the existing circumstances in the region.
2. 2 ways we have looked at this structure
  - a. Opportunity areas
  - b. Racial disparities
3. Factor which to focus
  - a. Investing in areas and communities viewed as marginalized.
  - b. Opening up opportunities in areas that would otherwise have none.
4. If you improve areas that are underdeveloped, then you improve lives on the lower end of the scale.
5. Issues like governance can open discussion of cooperation and regional vision.
6. Linking this study with Analysis of Impediments for fair housing:
  - a. It is very important to use this information and strategies in planning for the Analysis of Impediments for fair housing plans (AI report) in the fall.



- b. Anthony has used the previous AI and current draft in during this study.
  - 7. We have looked at race but not age. Is this addressed?
    - a. Spent time on the aging population but have yet to translate it into a visual format.
    - b. The population is getting older and schools are losing enrolment.
- b. Scenario Planning Engagement Recap
  - i. Scenario planning workshops are wrapped up.
  - ii. Total: 770 citizen, 113 maps, 27 workshops throughout the region.
  - iii. Diversify participation was a main goal.
    - 1. Churches, office buildings, bar room, historic buildings, downtown lofts, high school students, UB students, rural communities, urban communities, non-profit groups, special needs, environmental community, planning boards.
  - iv. Next step is finalizing the process of maps from workshops to finalizes data and analyze.
  - v. Present scenarios in June and create a condensed version to take on the road.
  - vi. Discussion/Questions
    - 1. Impressed at the level of engagement.
    - 2. Method are reminiscent of old planning techniques.
    - 3. Community education of local planning issues and efforts were creative and innovative. Sustainability seems to be an issue people embrace and already have a basic understanding of.
    - 4. Public process brings the benefit of less criticism due to communicating with one's peers and leaving it open ended.
    - 5. Taking it a step further through a geographic sensibility
      - a. A Geographic based scenario is one of the challenges, due to variety and abundance of central tendencies with mapping results.
      - b. Scenarios may become less showing land use maps and more creating strategies through data metrics and underlying themes.
      - c. More multi-dimensional that initial framework? More than just population representation? Opportunity to create scenarios through opportunities and jobs
      - d. Where is the community conscience? How do you want to represent the people's vision?



- i. Measuring the implications of planning between compact and dispersed communities.
      - ii. Scenarios are being based on a sliding scenario approach (compact v. dispersed)
        - 1. This sliding bar is applied to multi factor and variable situation.
        - 2. Depending where you are on the sliding bar represents different building/place types. This method should be integrated into the final vision.
    - e. Other Regional Planning techniques: developing a tool used to show implications of changing factors in an equation.
    - f. How to bring these metrics back to the communities? Matter of implication.
- 6. External Comparison
  - a. More of an academic approach rather than a consulting mentality.
  - b. Taking a few levels higher than others might be doing.
  - c. Laid out assumptions to create a situation which reminded people about growth and moving forward as a region.
  - d. Projecting growth is skeptical mentality but many people are positively responding.
  - e. "Textizen" survey are reflecting a positive outlook
  - f. The game is based on the 2006 recommendation of economic Erie/ Niagara vision. Aggressive Compact development seems to be an underlining vision rather than spread out development. More aggressive regional framework.
  - g. State perspective: Thoughts of bringing this back to Albany, NY. This is an impressive model of aggressive community outreach being done in no other parts of the state.
- 7. Citizen Planning School
  - a. First session: 4/12/14 @ 10am
  - b. 180+ have signed up
  - c. 63 applicants for "champion for change"
    - i. Only 20 will be accepted and will be given a notification on Monday.



- ii. Vision and diversity will be taken into account when finalizing applicants. (Geographic/ race/ age)
- d. Identify projects created through this planning school and compare them to the theme from One Region Forward's data collection for scenarios.
- e. Looking for grass roots participation as major leaders in community projects. (ground-up approach)
- f. Discussion/ Question
  - i. Is the citizen planning school going to continue and who is going to pay for it?
  - ii. UB is prepared to take on this course as a 3 credit class and promote public engagement.
  - iii. Open to creating 5 course sequence and creating a certificate program through the SUNY system.
  - iv. Opportunities for continuing education credits.
  - v. Opportunities to have different tracks: public, private, and training (architect and engineers).
  - vi. An element will remain a free program for students and public.
  - vii. Citizen Planning portion will always be free
  - viii. Business component will be addressed outside this framework for Citizen planning school
  - ix. Open to partnering with other colleges as a community organizations.
  - x. Possible future funding through "Cleaner Greener New York" initiative in released in May.

## 2. Draft Plan Update

- a. Currently in the works and will be ready for viewing for the steering committee in May
- b. Next Community Congress is June 10<sup>th</sup>. Draft plan will be posted one week prior.
- c. Next engagement for local government leaders set for May 22<sup>nd</sup>.
- d. Discussion/ Questions
  - i. What should we talk to local government leaders about?
  - ii. How do we want to reconvene our Private Sector Council?
  - iii. How deep do we want to go both parties in terms of presenting the draft plan?
  - iv. Asking them to get participation from all local governments and association of peers. Erie County Governance will be a good resource for this. Mayor of Williamsville is a good resource.
  - v. Provide a draft plan to present to public leaders.



- vi. Graphic of the results would be a good method to present data to community leaders. Stresses the scope of 1RF as a large scale community engagement effort.
- vii. Keeping in mind that local government feel “under the gun” due to actions of the state. Looking at materials indicating the impact on local government impacts. It is important to show this program will not negatively affect local government. Focus on representing the importance of local government in a regional vision.
  - 1. Workshops have proven that local residents and government are interested in development of the broader region.
  - 2. Local Government feeling “being under the Gun” is a reality.
- viii. Substance of the plan should outline costs/revenue to local government. Make recommendations in the draft which will address local government concerns.
- ix. Framework of the developing plan emphasizes home rule of local jurisdiction. Respectful of what we have learned and that there are no stereotypical people. It is the best interest both locally and regionally.
- x. Whole data construction is creating an expert best practices, independent of preference.
- xi. Typecasting communities is in danger of losing sight of the scenario planning process.
- xii. National Market Trends validate the results of the game and the game validates National Market trends. Scenarios should be contextual according to economic diverse communities we are seeing.
- xiii. Emerging ideas of implementation: Supervisor Walters: how do we get them done? Providing incentives from the county level or above.
- xiv. Private Sector presenting data in trends and where the private sector plays in each scenarios. They are going to want to hear about implementation steps and the process and maybe talking about future obstacles.
- xv. Concept of legislative council and private sector council. I there a value in bringing these groups together or separately? Do we lose a quality of dialogue?
- xvi. Discussion
  - 1. Opportunity to possibly do both. Joe Minicozzi could potentially speak at a public/ private council meeting. He can use information and mapping of Onondaga County in Syracuse as an comparison to Erie/Niagara counties. Presentation based on property tax revenue.
  - 2. Laura Smith: Invitation of a conference call is to talk about these umber. Date in tentative.



3. Projects you want Joe Minicozzi to highlight and run his tax revenue numbers on?
4. Implementation tool: taking any community and talking about solutions. Highlight different properties and show implications of different project types (redevelopment, sustainability). Do current municipal code allow this? What are the negatives and positives? What would be the increased tax base?
5. We should focus and a variety of building types?
6. Retail numbers are ruin the out this layout
7. Possibility of running the meeting in Elma, NY
8. June 3 meeting with Minicozzi: public private councils.
  - a. Two meetings: one in Erie County and one in Niagara County
  - b. Open meeting with public and private
9. Some of the best conversations in the workshops were when the
10. May 22 event could be a precursor to a June 3 meeting.
11. Tax Revenue Benefits: what are the impacts of differ rent land use patterns. Where are the profit centers?
12. Meeting early next week to decide private sector

**3. Implementation (sitting agenda topic)**

- a. What happens after December? Aim on continuing the mechanism and responsibility of a regional vision.
- b. Jumping off point: what can we get started? What can we do in the next year?
- c. Is there a CFA opportunity in this? Allocating funds from CFA to plans which meet guidelines which promote regional stewardship.
- d. Creating a subcommittee to create an implementation plan to bring back to the steering committee. Should be open to the entire steering committee. Use of “doodle poll” to show general interest. Date and organization of subcommittee tentative.
- e. Potential pushing the next meeting to May 9<sup>th</sup>

**4. Closing**

- a. Any other comments.
- b. B. Roberts commends the discipline and creativity coming from this committee
- c. April 15 Partnership Buffalo- Niagara John Norquist has an event about the downtown market and best practices/ trend in market condition and design element.
  - i. Smith theater at 3pm. 83-85 people already signed up
- d. Thanks for getting the word out about the letter of interest of CFA involvement.